

## **APPENDIX F**

# **NATIONAL PUBLIC CONSULTATION AND PARTICIPATION WORKSHOP ON THE RESETTLEMENT ACTION PLAN**

### **Table of Contents**

<b>F-1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>F-2</b>	<b>LETTER OF INVITATION.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>F-3</b>	<b>AGENDA .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>F-4</b>	<b>LIST OF ATTENDEES.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>F-5</b>	<b>EVALUATION QUESTIONNAIRE AND RESPONSE .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>F-6</b>	<b>OPENING ADDRESS .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>F-7</b>	<b>CONCLUDING ADDRESS.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>F-8</b>	<b>NT2 IN THE PERSPECTIVE OF INTERNATIONAL RESETTLEMENT EXPERIENCE..</b>	<b>20</b>

## **F-1 INTRODUCTION**

On January 21 and 22, 1999 a National Public Consultation on the RAP took place in Vientiane. It was organized by the NT2 Resettlement Committee, with support from STENO (now the Science, Technology and Environment Agency (STEA)) and NTEC. In attendance were 136 persons, representing a wide range of stakeholders. The Workshop was an essential activity of the NT2 Public Consultation and Participation Process (PCPP). This process is discussed in detail in Chapter [13] of the RAP.

According to the participating World Bank PCPP mission, the January 21-22, 1999 National Public Consultation Workshop.

“...was very well organized and managed by STENO, with valuable assistance from NTEC, and was jointly chaired by the governor of Khammouane Province and STENO. Given the critical role of the province in implementing the RAP, this is a welcome development. Additionally, the Workshop was opened by Mr. Xayxengly Tengbliacheu, the Minister to the Prime Minister’s Office and President of Central Leading Committee for Rural Development. The workshop was attended by over 100 people, many from the relevant districts. There was a good presentation on how public consultation had changed the RAP design. The level of discussion was very interesting, both in terms of the level of detailed questions (demonstrating a greater understanding of the overall plan) and in terms of the open and transparent debate on policy and principles.”

The evaluation of the Workshop indicated that 82 percent of the audience felt that the RAP was adequate and 88 percent felt that the Workshop had served its purpose. Ninety percent were in favor of the resettlement proceeding.

A complete Record of Workshop proceedings was subsequently distributed to all participants, as well as to many non-attendees, either in Lao or English. This gave them an opportunity to review the post-workshop responses that had been prepared to answer the questions asked in the small groups discussions. Since there were three discussion groups, this provided everyone with an insight into the discussions of the other groups. The full Workshop Record was made available on request in both Lao and English, in electronic or hard copy form, from STENO and NTEC in Vientiane. In addition to all the presentation, the Workshop Record contains a list of 150 questions asked during the group discussion sessions and the post-workshop responses provided by NTEC to each question.

### **Selected Workshop Documents – January 21-22, 1999**

- Letter of Invitation
- Agenda
- List of Attendees
- Evaluation Questionnaire and Response
- Opening Address
- Concluding Address
- NT2 in the perspective of international resettlement experience

F-2 LETTER OF INVITATION

LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC  
PEACE INDEPENDENCE DEMOCRACY UNITY PROSPERITY

-----  
Science Technology and Environment Organization - STENO  
PO Box 2279 Vientiane, Lao PDR

No:...../STENO

December . . .1998

**Subject: Invitation to attend the National Public Consultation and Participation Workshop to discuss the final Resettlement Action Plan for the Nam Theun 2 Hydroelectric Project, Vientiane, 21 – 22 January 1999**

Dear Sir or Madam,

Your organization is cordially invited to attend the National Public Consultation and Participation Workshop on the final Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) for the Nam Theun 2 Hydroelectric Project.

This workshop will be held on 21 – 22 January 1999 at the Lane Xang Hotel, in Vientiane.

Please find attached a copy of the executive summary and the table of contents for the July 1998 Resettlement Action Plan for the Nam Theun 2 Project. Also attached are a tentative agenda for the two day workshop, a Nam Theun 2 Project Overview update and a document answering Commonly Asked Questions on the RAP.

During the last two years, the Government of Lao PDR has collected many opinions and view points on resettlement for the NT2 Project. Major examples were the national and regional consultations which took place in Vientiane on June 2-3, 1997 and in Khammouane Province on June 5, 1997 after the release of the Draft RAP in May 1997. Further direct inputs resulted from the local public consultation and participation conducted in April-May this year, during which the villagers of the Nakai Plateau reacted and commented on different aspects of the resettlement plan and livelihood models as they had been modified after earlier villager input. The present RAP document is intended to reflect the various opinions received on these important subjects from all stakeholders. At the workshop, speakers will report on how previous inputs have been included in this RAP.

Complete color copies of the RAP are available for public access and also for purchase at the following locations:

- Nam Theun 2 Public Information Center, STENO, Vientiane
- Nam Theun 2 Electricity Consortium (NTEC)  
26 Khun Boulom Road, Vientiane  
Lao PDR  
Tel: (856-21) 217 421/2, 218 607/8  
Fax: (856-21) 217 420  
  
e-mail: [ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th](mailto:ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th)

Also available free of charge by e-mail from [ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th](mailto:ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th) are full copies (without maps and pictures) of the Resettlement Action Plan and the 1998 Report on PCPP with villagers on the Nakai Plateau.

We would be very pleased if you could confirm, at your earliest possible convenience, your intention to attend this workshop, which would be at your own expense.

Should you be interested, could you kindly provide the following information:

- Name of participant or participants, address, telephone and fax number.  
[e-mail address if available]
- The nature of your organization, in particular as it relates to the topic of this Nam Theun 2 study.

It would also be helpful to know the qualifications of the participants so as to effectively plan this workshop and provide interesting discussion for all concerned. Could you please advise the nature of your participants' experience in Lao PDR and the aspects likely to be of greatest interest to them.

For those participants coming from abroad, STENO will make the necessary entry visa arrangements upon arrival at Vientiane airport, the 'Friendship Bridge' or at any other appropriate or convenient location. The following information is required for the issuance of a travel visa to Lao PDR:

- Full name and address of participant
- Citizenship and date of birth
- Passport number and date of expiry
- Expected arrival date in Vientiane and flight information

We would be grateful for your early reply to the following address.

Tel: (+856-21) 217 421, 217 422  
Tel: (+856-21) 218 607, 218 608  
Fax: (+856-21) 217 420, 218 610, 213 472

e-mail: [ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th](mailto:ntecvte@loxinfo.co.th)  
Attn: Mr. S. Phanousith  
Director of Cabinet  
STENO  
PO Box 2279  
Vientiane, Lao PDR

Any queries should be directed to:

Ms Viengsavanh Douangsavat Deputy Director,  
Department of Science, Technology & Environment Data  
Information, STENO

Mr Ketkeo Salichanh Department of Science, Technology &  
Environment Data Information, STENO

If you have received this Invitation and Agenda by facsimile, a hard copy with all four attachments has been separately mailed to you.

Yours Sincerely,

Somphone Phanousith  
Director of Cabinet

**F-3 AGENDA**

**ACTUAL**

**National Public Consultation and Participation Workshop  
on Resettlement Action Plan  
for Nam Theun 2 Hydroelectric Project  
Vientiane, 21 – 22 January 1999**

**AGENDA**

**Chairmanship Committee:**

- H.E. Mr. Xayxengly Tengbliacheu *Minister to Prime Minister's Office & President of Central Leading Committee for Rural Development*
- H.E. Mr. Khen Phalivong *Governor of Khammouane Province, Chairman of NT2 Resettlement Committee*
- H.E. Mr. Somphong Mounghounvilay *Vice President, State Planning Committee*
- H.E. Mr. Noulinh Sinbandhit *Vice-President, STENO*
- Mr. Bouathong Phounsalth *General Secretary, Domestic Investment Promotion Committee, CIC.*
- Mr. Somboun Manolom *Former Chairman of NT2 Resettlement Committee*
- Mr. Done Somvorachit *Deputy Director of Electricity Department, Ministry of Industry and Handicrafts*
- Mr. Bouasone Phongphavanh *Director Press Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs*
- Mr. Somdy Douangdy *Director Mass Media, Ministry of Information and Culture*
- Mr. Somdy Douangdy *Director Planning Department. State Planning Committee*

**DAY 1 THURSDAY 21, JANUARY 1999.**

- 8:00-8:30 Registration. Hand-out Final Agenda. Invitation papers and other documents available on request
- 8:30-8:40 Opening remarks from the Chairman
- 8:40-9:00 Opening address *H.E. Mr. Xayxengly Tengbliacheu  
Minister to Prime Minister's Office  
& President of Central Leading Committee for Rural Development*
- 9:00-9:10 Explanatory address by the Independent Facilitator

- 9:10-9:25 Overview of NT2 Resettlement Action Plan Objectives, Principles, Timing, Cost and Responsibilities and main improvements from the 1997 Draft RAP.  
*Jean-Christophe Delvallet  
Project Director, NTEC*
- 9:25-9:40 Development of GOL Legal and Policy Framework for Resettlement  
*H.E. Mr. Khen Phalivong  
Governor Khammouane Province  
& Chairman Resettlement Committee*
- 9:40-10:10 Coffee Break
- 10:10-11:00 Features of July 1998 RAP. 1998 PCPP on Nakai Plateau.  
*Martin ter Woort  
Senior Resettlement Consultant, ACRES  
Stephen Sparkes  
Senior Social Scientist, NORPLAN*
- 11:00-11:10 Explanation of aims/format for Small Group Discussions  
*Independent Facilitator*
- Hand-out speech notes to facilitate Small Group Discussions, Session 1
- 11:10-12:00 Small Group Discussions, Session 1
- 12:00-13:00 Lunch Break *(Buffet Lunch available at Lane Xang)*
- 13:00-13:40 Reporting back from Small Group Discussions, Session 1
- 13:40-14:30 Infrastructure Planning and Implementation. Livelihood Models.  
*Loy Chansavat  
General Manager, Resettlement, NTEC  
Martin ter Woort  
Senior Resettlement Consultant, ACRES*
- 14:30-15:00 Coffee Break. Hand-out speech notes to facilitate Small Group Discussions Session 2
- 15:00-16:30 Small Group Discussions, Session 2

**DAY 2 FRIDAY 22, JANUARY 1999.**

- 8:00-8:30 Reporting back from Small Group Discussions, Session 2
- 8:30-8:45 GOL NT2 Implementation Program. Organization Framework and Responsibilities  
*Mr. Bouathong Phounsarith  
General Secretary, Domestic Investment Promotion Committee, CIC  
Former Chairman, NT2 Resettlement Committee*

- 8:45-9:30 Resettlement experience in the Lao PDR.  
*H.E. Mr. Xayxengly Tengbliacheu  
Minister to Prime Minister's Office  
& President of Central Leading Committee for Rural Development*
- 9:30-9:45 Coffee Break
- 9:45-10:15 NT2 in the perspective of international resettlement experience  
*Professor Thayer Scudder  
Anthropologist, California Institute of Technology  
Member of NT2 International Environmental & Social Panel of Experts*
- Hand-out speech notes to facilitate Small Group Discussions, Session 3
- 10:15-11:45 Small Group Discussions, Session 3
- 11:45-12:00 Completion of Workshop Evaluation Forms by all Participants
- 12:00-13:00 Lunch Break *(Buffet Lunch available at Lane Xang)*
- 13:00-13:45 Reporting back from Small Group Discussions, Session 3
- 13:45-14:15 Plenary Discussion – Questions and Comments
- 14:15-14:30 Report on Participants' Evaluation Analysis  
*H.E. Mr. Noulinh Sinbandith  
Vice President, STENO*
- 14:30-14:40 Summary and Conclusions by Chairman, followed by Closing Afternoon Tea
- Hand-out typed-up Questions raised in Small Group Discussions, Sessions 1 & 2

***Note: All documents handed out were available in both Lao and English.***



F-4 LIST OF ATTENDEES

**PCPP WORKSHOP ON NT2 RAP  
VIENTIANE, 21-22 JANUARY 1999  
LIST OF ACTUAL ATTENDEES**

NAME	TITLE	ORGANISATION
<b>Central Government Representatives &amp; Agencies</b>		
<b>Prime Minister's Office</b>		
Xayxengly Tengbliacheu	Minister, President Central Leading Committee for Rural Development	Prime Minister's Office
Philavanh Nasoukkoum	Officer CLCRD	Prime Minister's Office
<b>STENO</b>		
Noulinh Sinbandith	Vice President	STENO
Viengsavanh Douangsavanh	Deputy Director, Department of Data & Information	STENO
Sayaveth Vixay	Head of Division	STENO
Ketkeo Salichanh	Officer	Dept. of Data & Information, STENO
Phimpha Outhachack	Officer	Dept. of Data & Information, STENO
Somdeth Souvannaphasy	Officer	Dept. of Data & Information, STENO
Somsanouk Phommakhot	Officer	STENO
<b>Ministry of Industry &amp; Handicrafts</b>		
Soumboun Manolom	Deputy Director	Electricity Department, MIH
Bounsalong Southidara	GOL NT2 Project Office, Resettlement Committee Member	Ministry of Industry & Handicrafts
Phalim Daravong	Officer	Ministry of Industry & Handicrafts
Vichit Daradsavong	Officer	GOL NT2 Office, MIH
<b>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</b>		
Done Somvorachit	Director	Press Dept., Ministry of Foreign Affairs
<b>State Planning Committee</b>		
Somphong Mounghounvilay	Vice President	State Planning Committee
Somdy Douangdy	Director	Planning Dept., State Planning Committee
Sirivanh Konthapane	Economic Research Institute	State Planning Committee
Vixay Homsombath	Officer	State Planning Committee

NAME	TITLE	ORGANISATION
<b>Committee for Investment &amp; Cooperation</b>		
Bouathong Phounsarith	General Secretary	Domestic Investment Promotion, CIC
Khamleuang Sayarath	Director, GOL NT2 Project	Committee for Investment & Cooperation
Sichat Bounsakittilat	Director	Hydropower Division, CIC
Bounmy Thepsimeuang	Director	Theun 1 Hydropower Project, CIC
Hoy Phomvisouk	Manager of Resettlement Management Unit NT2	Domestic Investment Promotion, CIC
<b>Ministry of Information &amp; Culture</b>		
Bouasone Phongphavanh	Director	Mass Media, Ministry of Information & Culture
Bounhom Chanthamat	Acting Director	Dept. of Museums & Archaeology, Ministry of Information & Culture
<b>Ministry of Agriculture &amp; Forestry</b>		
Bounthong Saysida	Deputy Director	Department of Forestry, MAF
<b>MTCP</b>		
Phouangphan Souvannabout	Head of Technical Division/Liaison Person TICA	Ministry of Transport, Communication, Post & Construction
<b>Ministry of Justice</b>		
Bounheng Phimmanivong	Legal Specialist	Ministry of Justice
<b>Ministry of Public Health</b>		
Phitthanosone	Deputy Head, Environmental Division	Ministry of Public Health
<b>National Assembly</b>		
Bouasy Lovanxay	Vice Chairman	Economic & Finance Commission, National Assembly
Samane Souvannasao	Senior Officer	National Assembly
<b>Bank of Lao PDR</b>		
Phonesavanh Khotsouvanh	Representative	Bank of Lao PDR
<b>Organization of Central Committee</b>		
Thongma Khamsenenam	Chief of Cabinet	Committee for Education & Training of Central Committee Party
<b>Lao Front for National Construction</b>		
Pheng Lasoukanh	Representative	Central Lao Front for National Construction
<b>Lao Women's Union</b>		
Onesy Saengmouang	Representative	Central Lao Women's Union

NAME	TITLE	ORGANISATION
<b>Lao Youth Union</b>		
Khamla Xaytha	Representative	Cental Lao Youth Union
<b>Lao Media</b>		
Anoulack Khammalavong	Journalist	Vientiane Times
Sisay Vilaysack	Sports Reporter, Photo Journalist	Vientiane Times
Bounta	Journalist	Lao Channel 3
Daoheuang	Journalist	Lao Channel 3
Manilay	Journalist	Lao National Radio
Thavone	Journalist	Lao National Radio
Somphoia Phommachack	Representative	Aroun Mai Newspaper
Khamsay Thammavong	Representative	Pasason Newspaper
Phonephet Sittivong	Journalist	KPL
Vongdeuane Somphanthong	Journalist	KPL
Douangta Manokoun	Rédacteur en chef	Le Rénovateur Newspaper
Michel Leroy	Writer	Le Rénovateur Newspaper
<b>Lao NGOs and Other Organizations</b>		
Bountheung Menvilay	Head of Disaster Preparedness-Relief Department	Lao Red Cross
Kongphachanh	Representative	Dongnasok Tai Village
Darouny Rattanavong	Managing Director	Vientiane International Consultant
Khambone Thirphouth	Head of Documentation Department	Institute of Cultural Research
Maninout Saming	Independent	
Soulivanh Sithprasay	Independent	
<b><u>Province, District &amp; Village Representatives</u></b>		
<b>Khammouane Province</b>		
Khen Phalivong	Governor, Chairman of NT2 Resettlement Committee	Khammouane Province
Thayaphone Singthong	Deputy Governor	Khammouane Province
Thongphoun Chanphenxay	Rural Development	Khammouane Province
Maniveng Petoudom	Administrative Office	Khammouane Province
Sivixay Soukkalat	Director	Agriculture & Forestry Dept., Khammouane
Khamphone Rajaschak	Director	Forestry Division, Khammouane
Thonglay Phommaxay	Director	Industry & Handicrafts Dept., Khammouane
Oneta Thiemchanda	Director	Communication, Transport, Post & Construction Department, Khammouane

NAME		TITLE	ORGANISATION
	Thammasinh Saykhamphanh	Elderly Person	Khammouane Province
	Khammany Inthirath	Director of EDL Khammouane, Member of N.A.	National Assembly, Khammouane EDL
<b>Lao Youth Union</b>			
	Somkouane Inthalangsy	Provincial President	Lao Youth Union, Khammouane
<b>Lao Women's Union</b>			
	Keo Oula Souliyadeth	Vice President	LWU, Khammouane Province
	Phengsy Damkhamdy	District President	LWU, Nakai District
	Keota Phengsavat	District President	LWU, Mahaxai District
	Vongvilay	District President	Khamkeut District
	Khamsy	Village President	LWU, Ban Sop On
	One	Village President	LWU, Ban Nakai Neua
	Khamkhiene Xayavongsouk	Village President	LWU, Ban Nam Phit
<b>Savannakhet Province</b>			
	Dr. Phengta Philakhamphone	Director	Industry & Handicraft Dept., Savannakhet Province
<b>Bolikhamxay Province</b>			
	Leuam Somsivisay	Chief of Cabinet	Bolikhamxay Province
<b>Nakai District</b>			
	Xat Songsavanh	Deputy Chief	Nakai District
	Bounpone Chanthalath	Chief of Division	Agriculture & Forestry Division, Nakai District
	Banchong	Chief of Village	Ban Nakai Neua
	Phone Phetoudone	Chief of Village	Ban Done
	Tone	Elderly Person	Ban Done
	Nonh	Chief of Village	Ban Phongsavang
	Khouane	Chief of Village	Ban Sop Phene Village
	Xiengkeo	Chief of Village	Ban Thalang
<b>Gnommalat District</b>			
	Gna Boutsida	District Governor	Gnommalat District
	Chard Lennalat	Chief of Cabinet	Gnommalat District
	Thongdy	Chief of Village	Ban Nam Phit
<b>Mahaxai District</b>			
	Bouansone Sengdavong	District Chief	Mahaxai District
<b><u>Diplomatic Corps and Foreign Community in Vientiane</u></b>			
	Renaud Lévy	Ambassador	French Embassy
	Bouasvan Bouasy	Commercial Attaché	French Embassy
	Felicity Volk	First Secretary	Australian Embassy
	Alan Bowman	Second Secretary	Canadian Embassy
	Tran Tho Ghi	Commercial Attaché	Vietnamese Embassy
	Gérard Larose	Director	Agence Française de Developpement

NAME		TITLE	ORGANISATION
	Catherine Larose	Director	ORSTOM
	Santi Sayarath		ORSTOM
<b><u>International Organizations</u></b>			
	Linda Schneider	Liaison Officer	World Bank
	Lars Lund	Senior Social Scientist	World Bank
	Kathryn McPhail	Social Policy and Resettlement Division	World Bank
	Lee Talbot	Professor of Environmental Science, International Affairs and Public Policy, George Mason University	International Environmental and Social Panel of Experts
	Thayer Scudder	Professor of Anthropology, California Institute of Technology	International Environmental and Social Panel of Experts
	Tim Whitmore	Tropical Botanist, University of Cambridge	International Environmental and Social Panel of Experts
	Jefferey Avina	Deputy Resident Representative	UNDP
	Mikiko Tanaka Sasaki	Assistant Resident Representative	UNDP
	Laetitia van Haren	Consultant, Social Anthropologist	UNDP
	Ratna Manivannan	Portfolio Manager	UNDP
	Stuart Chape	Director, Lao Office	IUCN
	John Baker	Project Manager	IUCN
	Jiddo van Drunen	Representative	UNHCR
	Yang Bao Ping		World Health Organization
	Dr. Joachim Metzner	Senior Environmentalist	GTZ
	Michael Hedemark	Country Program Coordinator	Wildlife Conservation Society
	Philavanh Khamphanthong	Representative	Bahai Development Agency
<b><u>International Media</u></b>			
	Frederik Balfour	Correspondent	Agence France Presse
	Timo Sipola	Journalist	Finnish Broadcasting Co.
<b><u>International Consultancy Firms, Scientists &amp; Others</u></b>			
	Martin ter Woort	Senior Consultant	ACRES International Limited
	Stephen Sparkes	Senior Social Scientist	NORPLAN
	Alex Arter	Managing Director	ENTEC
	Maria Aycrigg	Social Development Scientist	Environmental Resource Management
	Dana Clark	Senior Attorney	Center for International Environmental Law
	Elif Kendirli	Ph. D. Student	University of Melbourne
	Miron Michel	Consultant	E.I.A. (Hydropower)
	Bruce Shoemaker	Independent Researcher	

	NAME	TITLE	ORGANISATION
	Alexandra Tissot	Social Scientist	
	Chanthy Phansavath	Country Manager	ATLAS COPCO
	Charles Jeanneret	Chief Technical Adviser	State Planning Committee
<b><u>Developer (NTEC)</u></b>			
	J-Ch. Delvallet	Project Director	
	Peter Goldston	Technical Director	
	Loy Chansavat	General Manager, Resettlement	
	Patrick Dye	Operations Manager	
	Steve Kirby	Manager, Technical Support	
<b><u>Independent Facilitators</u></b>			
	Mary Flipse	Independent Facilitator	Dirksen Flipse Doran & Lê
	Somsanouk Mixay	Independent Facilitator	Vientiane Times
	Maliphet Soukhaseum	Independent Facilitator	UNICEF
	Bouakhaikhone Savengseuksa	Independent Facilitator	National University of Laos
	Khamkhong Kongvongsa	Independent Facilitator	Ministry of Information & Culture
<b><u>Translators</u></b>			
	Soradeth Bannavong	Translator	KPL
	Dethmahinh Souphanh	Translator	National Library
			<b>Total Attendees : 136</b>

F-5 EVALUATION QUESTIONNAIRE AND RESPONSE

22 ມັງກອນ 1999  
 22 January, 1999  
 ໂຄງການ ນ້ຳເທີນ 2  
 Nam Theun 2

ກອງປະຊຸມປຶກສາຫາລື ແລະ ເຂົ້າຮ່ວມຂອງມວນຊົນ ກ່ຽວກັບແຜນການຍົກຍ້າຍຈັດສັນປະຊາຊົນ  
**Public Consultation and Participation Process on Resettlement Action Plan**

ການປະເມີນຜົນຂອງກອງປະຊຸມສຳມະນາໂດຍຜູ້ເຂົ້າຮ່ວມ

**Participants Evaluation of Workshop**

ກະລຸນາໃຊ້ເວລາຈັກ 2-3 ນາທີເພື່ອຕອບຄຳຖາມດັ່ງຕໍ່ໄປນີ້  
 ບໍ່ຈຳເປັນຕ້ອງເຊັນຊື່ທ່ານລົງກໍໄດ້

**Please take a few minutes to answer these questions.  
 There is no need to sign your name.**

ລ/ດ No.	ຄຳຖາມ Question	ແມ່ນ YES	ບໍ່ແມ່ນ NO	ປະກອບຄຳເຫັນຫຍັງບໍ່ Any Comments
1.	ການຈັດຕັ້ງກອງປະຊຸມສຳມະນານີ້ດີບໍ່? Do you consider the workshop well organized?	71	1	
2.	ແຜນການຍົກຍ້າຍຈັດສັນປະຊາຊົນໄດ້ຖືກອະທິບາຍດີບໍ່? Was the RAP well explained?	70	2	
3.	ທ່ານຄິດວ່າການຄົ້ນຄວ້າສົນທະນາໃນໜ່ວຍມີຜົນດີບໍ່? Did you find the small group discussions useful?	70	2	
4.	ທ່ານໄດ້ມີຄວາມຄິດຄວາມເຫັນ ຫຼື ຄຳຖາມໃນກອງປະຊຸມນີ້ບໍ່? Did you make any comments or ask questions during the sessions?	53	16	
5.	ທ່ານໄດ້ຮັບຄຳຕອບ ຫຼື ຄຳອະທິບາຍພຽງພໍບໍ່? Did you receive an adequate response or explanation?	59	10	

ລ/ດ No.	ຄຳຖາມ Question	ແມ່ນ YES	ບໍ່ແມ່ນ NO	ປະກອບຄຳເຫັນຫຍັງບໍ່ Any Comments
6.	ເອກກະສານທີ່ທ່ານໄດ້ຮັບນັ້ນມີຜົນປະໂຫຍດຕໍ່ທ່ານບໍ່? Did you find the printed material provided useful?	71	0	
7.	ທ່ານຄິດວ່າ ທ່ານເຂົ້າໃຈແຜນການຍົກຍ້າຍຈັດສັນປະຊາຊົນດີຂຶ້ນກວ່າເກົ່າບໍ່? Do you now feel that you understand the RAP better than before?	69	2	
8.	ອີງໃສ່ຄວາມເຂົ້າໃຈຂອງທ່ານກ່ຽວກັບແຜນການຍົກຍ້າຍຈັດສັນປະຊາຊົນ ທ່ານຄິດວ່າແຜນການນີ້ຄົບຖ້ວນແລ້ວບໍ່? Based on what you now know, do you think the RAP is adequate?	59	8	
9.	ທ່ານຄິດວ່າກອງປະຊຸມນີ້ບັນລຸຈຸດປະສົງບໍ່? Do you think the workshop has served its purpose?	63	1	
10.	ທ່ານເຫັນດີເຫັນພ້ອມກັບໂຄງການນ້ຳເທີນ 2 ແລະ ແຜນການຍົກຍ້າຍຈັດສັນປະຊາຊົນທີ່ຕາມມານີ້ບໍ່? Are you in favor of NT2 and the RAP proceeding?	65	0	

ຖ້າທ່ານມີການປະກອບຄຳເຫັນ ຫຼືການແນະນຳເພີ່ມເຕີມ, ກະລຸນາຂຽນເພີ່ມໃສ່ນີ້ :

This space for any additional comments and suggestion:



**F-6 OPENING ADDRESS**

**Opening Address  
H.E. Xaixengly Tengbliacheu,  
Minister to the Prime Minister's Office,  
President of Central Leading Committee for Rural Development,  
At the Inaugural Session of the Public Consultation Workshop & Public  
Consultation on the Final Draft of RAP for NT2**

**Vientiane, January 21-22, 1999**

- **Mr. Khen Phalivong, Governor of Khammouane Province,  
Chairman of the NT2 Resettlement Committee**
- **Ladies and Gentlemen,**

I am honored and very pleased to represent the Lao government at this inaugural session of the Public Consultation and Public Participation on the final draft of RAP for NT2, being opened here today. On this occasion, I would like to express my pleasure in warmly welcoming the participants coming from the grassroots, local communities and representatives of the government's institutions for having kindly accepted the invitation to this consultation. I also like to welcome members of the diplomatic corps, representatives of the international organizations, international scientists and experts, the officials of the NGOs for having shown interest in the social and environmental aspects of the NT2.

**Distinguished delegates,**

In the present Asian economic crisis, the Lao PDR needs to strive even more to receive export income. The NT2 Hydropower Project is considered to be highly efficient from technical as well as from economic stand points. The NT2 price can compete in the market. Being as it is, the Project can attract foreign investment. Hence, this Project is one of the few available options for the country as far as export is concerned.

The NT2 is one project that can bring the Lao Government with a significant amount of hard foreign currencies. Almost half of the net revenue from selling electricity will go to the Government in the form of taxes on resources (royalties), income tax and dividends. The revenue derived from the project will permit the Lao Government to alleviate poverty in the country through developing socio-economic infrastructure such as roads, irrigation, schools and hospitals and others.

One particular and direct benefit among others which the project affected people will receive has to do with the Resettlement Action Plan whose true nature can be said to be an integrated rural development plan. In effect, the Resettlement Action Plan clearly reflects the policy and prioritized programmes of the government. The plan, in addition, also takes into account the policy and Operational Guidelines of the World Bank, thus providing the plan an international standard in quality.

The NT2 Project will provide a good opportunity to Lao entrepreneurs and construction service providers to participate in the undertaking by providing construction materials and subcontracting services. Additionally, the project will provide jobs to Lao technicians, professionals and workers in general during the construction and operational phases. Equally important is that during the construction phase as well as throughout the concession period, the project will provide funds for the protection and conservation of the NT2 catchment area, which has special international value due to its unique biodiversity features.

Because of the extensive beneficial nature of the NT2 which the Lao PDR will gain from the project, the Lao Government has decided to make NT2 its top priority hydropower export project.

**Ladies and Gentlemen,**

The Lao people and government traditionally have exercised consultation and public participation in decision making process in matters related to the well being and the future of the people, and this process is not neglected in the case of NT2. We are very pleased to see that within the framework of NT2 some fundamental studies related to the project have been carried out and in this connection, we are glad to say that the designing of the resettlement plan has been developed through the process of consultation with and participation of the affected people.

The rich pool of opinions, and constructive criticism expressed at the various consultations and public participation, held nearly two hundred occasions at the grassroots, regional and national levels, were studied and incorporated to improve the quality of the RAP. Hence, the public consultation and public participation process required by the Bank goes along well with the country's community decision-making tradition which has facilitated the said process in a systematic manner.

Lastly, I would like to hope that this public consultation workshop will make an added contribution to improving the resettlement action plan, and this in turn will meet the aspiration of the people affected by the NT2 Project. This is to say that the RAP will acquire an internationally accepted standard required by the World Bank's policy and directives.

I would like to wish the workshop every success!

Thank you.

**F-7 CONCLUDING ADDRESS**

**Concluding Speech  
by H.E. Mr. Khen Phalivong, Governor of Khammouane,  
Chairman of the Nam Theun 2 Resettlement Committee  
at the National Public Consultation and Participation Workshop  
on Resettlement Action Plan for Nam Theun 2 Hydroelectric Project**

**Vientiane, January 21-22, 1999**

- **Respected members of the Presidium,**
- **Ladies and Gentlemen,**

This workshop, which was attended by 136 persons, 35% of whom were from the grassroots and villages, approaches the end of its second and last day.

The workshop has listened to the presentation of the final draft of the Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) by the representatives of the Government, independent consultants and experts and by representatives of NTEC. Following the presentation, the workshop's participants extensively discussed issues related to the papers in small group discussion during which a rich pool of ideas and comments have been forwarded, and we would like to say these comments are very much appreciated.

Our workshop was honored by the presence of H.E. Xayxengly Tengbliacheu, Minister to the Prime Minister's Office, President of the Central Leading Committee for Rural Development and we heard him speaking about rich lessons in rural development in the country. In addition, the workshop heard extensive and precious experience drawn from international lessons on resettlement by Professor Thayer Scudder, member of the International Environmental and Social Panel of Experts on NT2. Compared with these international experiences, we are proud to hear his positive evaluation of the NT2 Resettlement Action Plan and the related extensive resettlement work prepared by the Government of Laos and NTEC. Professor Scudder, we will carefully pay special attention to your valuable comments. Having said that, we hope that your International Environmental and Social Panel will continue providing us with ideas and advice so that we can implement the NT2 Project, particularly the RAP, with success.

Many questions have been raised and opinions expressed at this workshop. They were raised with a purpose to better understand the issue. We consider them constructive and useful for improving the RAP.

**Ladies and Gentlemen,**

As a result of this workshop and the previous ones as well, we are pleased to observe that consensus has been reached. The NT2 Project Affected People as well as the authorities at all levels unitedly approve the NT2 Project, the number one priority of the Government. They welcome and agree to the RAP.

In the next few weeks, the Resettlement Committee and NTEC will study and add opinions and comments expressed at this workshop into the resettlement plan that we have been talking about. Then the plan will be submitted to the Government for approval.

The Public Consultation and Participation Workshop on Resettlement Action Plan for NT2, conducted for the last two days is about to close. But the public consultation and participation will go on with people who will be affected by the project. That is to say detailed consultation at household level on how to achieve the plan.

The Resettlement Committee considers that this plan has every condition for success. These favorable factors for successful resettlement include the following:

1. Clear Government NT2 policy on resettlement,
2. Good natural resource base,
3. Good relocation sites acquired, following the decision by villagers,
4. Good economic prospects,
5. Adequate financial resources,
6. Appropriate resettlement organization,
7. Active support from:
  - The Government,
  - The Project, and
  - The resettlers.

Based on the above-mentioned factors, the Resettlement Committee, the other concerned Government institutions, as well as the administrative authorities at provincial and grassroots level, have a strong belief that we will be able to execute the plan with success.

Finally, on behalf of the workshop's presidium, I would like to express my wholehearted thanks to the participants for having sacrificed your time and expressed your keen interest from the beginning till the end of the two day workshop. I would like to wish you the very best of health and success.

Thank you for your attention!

## **F-8 NT2 IN THE PERSPECTIVE OF INTERNATIONAL RESETTLEMENT EXPERIENCE**

The POE attended the January 1999 National Public Consultation on the RAP. One of its members, Professor Thayer Scudder of the California Institute of Technology and a recognized authority on resettlement, was kind enough to address the Workshop on how the NT2 proposed resettlement can be viewed in the context of international experience. There are a number of valuable lessons that can be learned through this comparison. Hence Professor Scudder's remarks are presented here in full.

### **Introduction**

Implementing a successful resettlement program has proved to be the most difficult task associated with hydropower projects.

Sustainable success cases are few in spite of the existence of international guidelines, which were first pioneered by the World Bank.

I think the major reason for this situation is an inadequate understanding of the nature of what I call the resettlement process. Since the 1950s there have been over 50 studies of dam resettlement around the world. Some began before removal and have followed people for many years after resettlement. It is because of this international experience that we can generalize about the impacts of resettlement on people, and on their responses to those impacts. And we can apply that knowledge to the NT2 situation.

I would like to briefly describe this process as it relates to planning and implementation to a SUCCESSFUL resettlement program. Please note the emphasis on success. That means internationally I am only talking about a small number of projects since the majority – as analyzed by various researchers including the World Bank's former sociological adviser – unfortunately end up impoverishing a majority of resetting households.

I define success in terms of program implementation that is environmentally, economically, institutionally and culturally sustainable. Granted the fact that the NT2 resettlers belong to ethnic minorities, the emphasis on cultural sustainability is important. By institutional sustainability I mean ensuring that the resettled population develop sufficient institutional capacity to compete for, and manage, their share of national resources. The time frame for successful resettlement is two generations and the process is divided into four stages. As I describe these, I will relate them to NT2 resettlement and the RAP.

### **Stage 1**

The first stage is the pre-relocation planning stage. It requires accurate identification of the population to be removed, a careful pre-resettlement benchmark demographic, epidemiological and socio-economic survey against which subsequent changes in living standards can be compared. And it requires a plan for implementation.

By international standards, the NT2 resettlement planning process is good. There are two major reasons for this.

Rarely completed on time elsewhere, in the NT2 case adequate demographic and socio-economic benchmark surveys have been carried out. On the other hand, further public health (especially nutritional) surveys are needed in my opinion. As for the evolving Resettlement Action Plan that is world class – simply excellent.

Since our last visit a year ago, a series of important planning events have taken place. Especially important has been increasing decentralization of the planning process from Vientiane to the provincial

and district levels. Our Panel is especially supportive of the re-organization of the Resettlement Committee with the Governor and Vice-Governor of Khammouane Province as chair and vice-chair. Also important is the increasing incorporation of district personnel into the planning process although more emphasis is needed on planning “with” the villagers as opposed to planning “for” them. Selection of a Pilot Village for a trial implementation of the resettlement plan starting in the next few months is also a major step forward.

The RAP, of course, must continue to evolve as the comments of the four working groups at the January 21-22, 1999 Public Consultation and Participation Workshop have already indicated. Monitoring, especially longitudinal nutritional monitoring will be required beyond 2006. At the above Workshop, NTEC consultant Martin ter Woort referred to the challenge of administrating the budget effectively and efficiently. A Joint Trust Fund, with UNDP assistance, like the UXO and HIV/AIDS Trust Funds I suspect would be the best way to proceed. Wider community and village trusts should also be considered.

## **Stage 2**

The second stage commences the implementation phase. It includes the physical removal of people and their initial adaptation to new conditions. The world experience is that this stage is very difficult for those resettled. Not only do they have to complete new houses and prepare new fields, but they also have to adjust to new economic opportunities – RAP’s livelihood system in the NT2 case. And they have to adjust to an increased government administrative presence which will inevitably curtail some of the resettlers’ previous freedom of action; hunting for example. As with Lao resettlement of hill people to the lowlands in recent years, rates of illness and even death rates may go up.

World wide, the living standards of a majority of resettlers tend to drop during this stage which can be expected to last for at least two years following in most cases. Indeed, there is a tendency of project related – living standards to be begin dropping even before removal. In anticipation of resettlement, that is because project affected people defer investments like clearing new fields or starting new businesses which they would have otherwise done. This situation is not sufficiently understood by planners who are apt to expect their plans to restore or even improve living standard during the first year. Will the NT2 case be an exception here? Perhaps it will for several reasons. First, most people – partly because of the war – are very poor to start with. Second, resettlement will be within culturally familiar areas – in many cases only a few kilometres from their current villages.

Third and very important the RAP is designed to significantly improve living standards by providing a range of opportunities. To compensate for the trauma and stress associated with this stage, even to restore pre-project living standards, it is essential to improve them. Designed to cover an eight-year period starting this year, the RAP intends to first restore and then improve living standards. Its intentions therefore are to exceed World Bank Guidelines. While World Bank Guidelines emphasize that resettlement projects must be development projects, and that resettlers should be project beneficiaries, the Bank’s guidelines nonetheless give governments a fallback position of merely restoring living standards. That I believe to be a major mistake since the international experience is that mere restoration actually tends to leave a majority of resettlers worse off. So the emphasis in the RAP on improving living standards not only is essential but is receiving increasingly international attention. Examples are the Guidelines of the private sectors’ International Commission on Large Dams, the national policy of the People’s Republic of China, and a recent evaluation of dam projects by the World Bank itself.

Despite the RAP’s excellence, there is no basis, however, for optimism. Many things can go wrong during those first eight years. Even if the development program proceeds as intended some households will find an initial drop in their living standards. I suspect, for example, that it will take a number of years for villagers with large buffalo herds to restore their living standards since they will only be allowed to take a portion of their buffaloes to resettlement sites. There is also evidence that even today some Nakai Plateau villagers are putting their lives on hold because of the project. During the recent visit of the World Bank’s Independent Advisory Group, for example, villagers in Ban Done are said to

have told the mission that they had stopped such activities as house construction and house repair, and new cultivation.

A more immediate problem may be an attempt on the part of government officials to increase the size of resettlement villages. World wide that temptation to increase administrative control is a constant threat to resettlement sustainability; indeed it is a recipe for resettlement failure. During our visit to a probable pilot resettlement community on the Nakai Plateau, of special concern to our Panel was discussion among officials about consolidating a number of small villages into units of at least 50 households. That figure of 50 households was related to the provision of primary schooling. Universal primary education is, of course, essential. However, the primary reasons for determining the size of resettlement villages MUST not be the preference of officials. Rather it MUST be the preference of the villagers themselves linked to the capacity of the resettlement sites to provide the necessary economic opportunities.

The mid-1970s resettlement in Ban Tha Moang in the Nakai-Nam Theun NBCA illustrates the costs resulting from consolidating villages for the primary purpose of increasing administrative and social services. There unacceptably high death rates occurred during the initial years, and today there are inadequate forest products in surrounding areas, while the inhabitants continue finding it difficult to undertake cooperative activities.

### **Stage 3**

The third stage in a successful resettlement process is the stage of economic and community development. If the RAP is effectively implemented I would expect this stage to begin accelerating during the third and fourth years. What characterizes this stage is a fascinating shift in the development strategies of a majority of resettling households from a risk-adverse position to a risk taking one. It has been best analyzed for 35,000 people resettled in what is now Zambia because of the first mainstream dam on the Zambezi and the 50,000 Egyptian Nubians resettled in connection with Egypt's Aswan High Dam.

In both cases Stage 3 was characterized by rapid development that involved a majority of households. While that development has been sustainable in the Egyptian case, it was unsustainable in the Zambian one so that twenty years after their removal the majority has fallen back into extreme poverty.

What is interesting about the third stage is that it shows that a majority of resettling households will respond to new opportunities once they have adjusted to their resettlement sites. Commencing over three years after removal, in both the Egyptian and Zambian cases the third stage was characterized by economic development, by greatly increased levels of education, and by a blossoming of culture. In the Egyptian case, the resettlers came to dominate the political economy of the primary location to which they were moved.

However for Stage three to occur major development opportunities must materialize in the Resettlement Areas.

The NT2 RAP is supposed to provide those opportunities through revenue from agriculture (including livestock), forest management, a reservoir fishery, handicrafts, and wage employment. Though the resettling households may appear conservative to outsiders, the world experience is that if realistic opportunities are present a majority of resettling households will seize them.

### **Stage 4**

Stage 4 brings the process for a successful resettlement program to an end. It entails two activities. One is handing over an improved livelihood to the second generation of settlers. For that livelihood to be sustainable, that second generation, at the very minimum, must have the institutional capacity to compete for their share of national, provincial and district resources.

The second activity involves the project authority, the NTPC in the NT2 case, successfully handing over its responsibilities to the resettled communities, the line ministries and other involved agencies such as the Lao Women’s Union. To deal with ongoing project related impacts, there also should be a Trust Fund, preferably financed with revenue from the sale of project electricity.

Such a fund has been pioneered very successfully since the 1980s in China where it is called a “Remaining Problems Fund”. There will always be remaining problems which exceed the capacity of resettled communities and the budgets of line ministries. A probable example in the NT2 case would be replacement of the ferry boats that will be required to connect the Nakai Plateau across the full reservoir with the Nakai-Nam Theun NBCA.

In summary, successful resettlement involves dealing with a complicated process lasting more than a generation and characterized by different constraints and opportunities at different times”.